

#	N°	Reference (e.g. Art, §)	Type	Reviewer	Reviewer's Comments, Questions, Proposals	Reply	Proposal for the correction or justification for the rejection
1	1	new Article 7a	G	CER	Ensuring that the proposed text for new article Article7a is provided to the European Commission in the final ERA Recommendation and is further integrated into NOI TSI:2022 submitted to RISC is essential.	A	
2	2	Appendix F 2	M	CER	The unit of parameter "B" should not be "dB re 1 micrometre" (which correspondings to the unit for roughness) but "dB re 1/(10-6 m)". <i>Note: combined with comment #3 below</i>	A	
3	3	Appendix F	P	CER	Following modification of the parameter B (transfer function) of Appendix F is suggested. Justification: - to take consideration of the minor changes from the last version of the DB project report (still to be delivered to the Agency), - adapt the method and make it consistent with the apl (axle per length) definition (as introduced in the TSI), as well as with the NICOBB project results (that were produced before the apl notion was setup in the TSI). These changes do not impact neither the principle of the method, nor change the already gathered results and existing Brake block classification. Reference A B Wavelength(m) (dB 10-6 m) (dB re 10-6 m) 0,00315 -17,9 -16,6 0,004 -16,2 -13,9 0,005 -15,5 -10,0 0,0063 -14,4 -6,9 0,008 -13,3 -6,2 0,01 -13,1 -5,4 0,0125 -12,8 -3,3 0,016 -12,4 -2,2 0,02 -10,9 -4,2 0,025 -11,1 -8,5 0,0315 -10,5 -11,2 0,04 -9,8 -14,3 0,05 -4,8 -15,6 0,063 -5,9 -17,3 0,08 -5,6 -23,7 0,1 -0,5 -29,0 0,125 2,4 -30,7 0,16 4,8 -31,7	A	Please deliver the new version of the report as soon as possible
4	4	7.1(1)	U	CER	CR384 added a new reference in NOI TSI 7.1(1) to recently amended L&P TSI 7.1.1.3 'Application to special vehicles' It shall be checked whether all operating modes (including working modes that are excluded from the scope of this TSI) are fulfilling noise exposure limits of workers in working conditions. Excluded modes shall not prevent to exclude compliance with Directive 2003/10/EC (exposure of workers to noise).		
5	5	6.2.2.4 Appendix B	P	CER	Reference to EN15892 should be replaced by a reference to EN ISO 3381:2021 as EN ISO 3381 supersedes EN 15892 by design. Also: ISO 3381:2021 = EN ISO 3381:2021. EN ISO 3381 covers all on-board measurements and not only the driver cab noise. TSI NOI should consequently refer only to the relevant sections of EN ISO 3381, i.e.: - section 7 for the measurement at standstill when the horn is sounding - section 8 for the measurement at max speed. However, 8.4.5 and 8.7.2 should be excluded as they relate to additional measurements not in direct relation to the NOI TSI.	D	As stated in the minutes of meeting of TWG STA meeting N°14 : CR555 : in order to proceed with this change request a proposal for modification including a comparison of the ISO and EN may be proposed to the agency before next TWG (15/09) . Otherwise, the CR will remain postponed
6	6	6.2.3 Table 7 Appendix B	P	CER	In 6.2.3 (simplified evaluation) and Appendix B, references to EN 13979-1 annex E shall be updated by reference to EN 13979-1:2020 annex I	A	this is ongoing with TWG-EDIT and already done in the draft master documents
7	7	Appendix B	M	CER	EN 15610:2019 (Chapter 6) has been referenced in Appendix F (Assessment of acoustic performance of a Brake Block). It shall be added in Appendix B as a new index.	A	this is ongoing with TWG-EDIT and already done in the draft master documents
8	1	Appendix B	G	NSA FR	Shouldn't standards quoted in an almost new appendix F be transferred to appendix B?	A	this is ongoing with TWG-EDIT and already done in the draft master documents

18	1		P	NSA IE	<p>The LOC & PAS TSI and SRT TSIs have an explicit statement that they may be considered voluntary for OTMs. The Noise TSI does not contain the same explicit statement. The Noise TSI applies to rolling stock within the scope of the LOC & PAS TSI. The LOC & PAS TSI is voluntary for OTMS, which implies that the Noise TSI is also voluntary. Without the explicit statement however, the legal text however in the Noise TSI is open to interpretation.</p> <p>The EU Agency for Railway (The Agency) application guide for the Noise TSI provides clarification, and states that the Noise TSI is voluntary for OTMs. The Application Guide is not a legal text.</p> <p>Inclusion of this requirement in the TSI itself would remove ambiguity on the legal basis of the interpretation contained in ERA guidance. There has been some debate around this issue in our Member State and clarification on this point would be very useful, i.e. the legal basis for the interpretation within the Agency guidance that the Noise TSI is voluntary for OTMs.</p>	A	<p>This is already considered in the Application Guide. In order to make it clearer, it is proposed to replace the paragraph '7.1.Application of this TSI to new subsystems</p> <p>(1)This TSI is applicable to all units of rolling stock in its scope which are placed on the market after the date of application of this TSI, except where the point 7.1.1.2 'Application to ongoing projects', of the LOC&PAS TSI or the point 7.1.1 'Application to ongoing projects' of the WAG TSI applies.'</p> <p>with</p> <p>'7.1.Application of this TSI to new subsystems</p> <p>(1)This TSI is applicable to all units of rolling stock in its scope which are placed on the market after the date of application of this TSI, except where the point 7.1.1.2 'Application to ongoing projects' of the LOC&PAS TSI, point 7.1.1.3 'Application to special vehicles, such as on-track machines' of the LOC&PAS TSI or the point 7.1.1 'Application to ongoing projects' of the WAG TSI applies.'</p>
28	1	6.2.2.2	U	NSA IT	<p>"In addition the noise shall be measured at a distance of 7,5 m from the centre of the track and a height of 1,2 m above top of rail. The 'averaged level method' and the 'maximum level method' in accordance with Section 7.6 and 7.5 respectively of EN ISO 3095:2013 shall apply and the train shall accelerate from standstill up to 40 km/h and then maintain the speed. The measured values are not assessed against any limit value and shall be recorded in the technical file and communicated to the Agency".</p> <p>In this part of TSI, possible misunderstandings are created related to the position of the microphone for different methods of measurement.</p>	D	<p>The Starting noise is measured between 0 and 30 km/h and also between 0 and 40 km/h.</p> <p>However, the position of the microphone does not change. The proposed slight amendment should clarify this:</p> <p>"In addition the noise shall be measured at the same distance from the centre of the track and same height above top of rail as set out in point 4.2.2. The 'averaged level method' and the 'maximum level method' in accordance with Section 7.6 and 7.5 respectively of EN ISO 3095:2013 shall apply and the train shall accelerate from standstill up to 40 km/h and then maintain the speed. The measured values are not assessed against any limit value and shall be recorded in the technical file and communicated to the Agency"</p>
29	2	Annex B	p	NSA IT	<p>In the Annex B are listed the harmonized rules (EN). New EN revisions are released, so it could be better to specify that the manufacturer should be designed and produced to the vehicle with the released EN at the time of design and production, then the test on the vehicle should be performed with the latest newer harmonized rule</p>		<p>This is ongoing with TWG-EDIT and already done in the draft master documents</p>
38	1	4.2.3.2	D	NSA NL - 3	<p>Friction element in NOI-TSI has no link to Loc&pas-TSI and WAG-TSI. Check is required.</p>	NWC	<p>As specified in clause 5.2.1 of the NOI TSI, Friction element for wheel tread brakes are interoperability constituents only for the 'rolling stock - freight wagons' subsystem.</p>